

ཐུགས་རྒྱུ

འགྲུབ་ལུ་ལྷན་སྐྱེས་པའི་

TRANSLATION & TRANSMISSION

ཐུགས་རྒྱུ

OCTOBER 2-5, 2014

KEYSTONE, COLORADO, USA

Workshop 2 | Room: CRESTONE PEAK II | 4:30–6:30pm, October 4, 2014

Translating Philosophical Materials B

with Klaus-Dieter Mathes, Douglas Duckworth, John Dunne



Klaus-Dieter Mathes
(University of Vienna)

Klaus-Dieter Mathes earned his doctorate at Marburg University, and is a Professor of Tibetology and Buddhist Studies at the University of Vienna, Austria. He previously worked as a research fellow and lecturer at the Asia Africa Institute at the University of Hamburg, Germany. His research in progress deals with the Indian origins of Tibetan Mahāmudrā traditions. Major publications include *“A Direct Path to the Buddha Within: Gö Lotsawa’s Mahāmudrā Interpretation of the Ratnagotravibhāga”* (Boston, Wisdom Publications: 2008). He is also a regular contributor to the *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies*.

Klaus-Dieter Mathes’s Presentation

Maitrīpa's Madhyamaka of Non-Abiding (Apratiṣṭhāna)

Tattvadaśaka

What is true reality? It is the form (i.e., the nature)¹ of entities,
And form is [indeed] no-form (i.e., emptiness),
Because² no-form is also form, given its being by nature
[Both] the fruit [to be attained] and the [co-emergent] cause [of suchness]. (TD 4)

Thus phenomena are [all] of one taste,
Unobstructed, and without an abode.
They are all [realized as] luminous
Through the *samādhi* of realizing true reality as it is. (TD 5)

Amanasikārādhāra

[Objection:]

The next [opponent] says: [True, the sense of *amanasikāra*] is also [found] in the tantra[s], [but] what it refers to does not exist, since [*manasikāra*] is the object of the negative particle in a non-affirming negation.

[Response:] That is not the case. [A non-affirming negation] is a negation of what is relevant: Not to negate what is not applicable is [the defining characteristic of] a non-affirming negation, like for instance “the wives of the king who do not see the sun.” The meaning of this is as follows: The wives of the king are indeed kept secret (i.e., protected from other men), so that they even do not see the sun.³ This does not imply the non-existence of the sun.⁴ Then what [does it imply]? What is applicable: that the wives of the king see the sun—that is what is negated. In the case of becoming mentally disengaged, too, it what is applicable—namely mental engagement [resulting] in something perceived, a perceiver and the like—that is negated by the privative *a*, and not the mind [itself].⁵ Therefore there is no fault.

...

¹ See TDT (B 17a₁; D 170b₅, P 186b₃₋₄): *de'i phyir dngos po'i de^a bzhin nyid ni de kho na nyid du bstan pa'o* |

^a B *rang*

² Nothing corresponds to Skt. *yataḥ* in the Tibetan.

³ “Sun” (*sūryaḥ*) is masculine in Sanskrit.

⁴ This sentence corresponds to Tib.: “Not knowing it in such a way does not mean that it is not.”

⁵ It is interesting that such a definition of non-affirming negation allows for a distinction between what is meant to be negated (“what is applicable”) and a luminous nature or emptiness of the mind, to which the yogin directs his attention (*manasikāra*), as we shall see further below. This distinction could be well taken as a forerunner of the Tibetan *gzhan stong* (“empty of other”) interpretation of emptiness. Likewise, in the case of taking *amanasikāra* as an affirming negation, only a particular aspect of the mind, namely that part of it which is engaged in the normal dualistic process of conceptualization, is negated. This does not entail the negation of all mental processes.

[*Amanasikāra* as a Compound in Which the Middle Word is Dropped]

Or, alternatively, the negative particle (i.e., the privative *a*) is only [used] in its usual [metaphorical] sense. This word (i.e., this negation) has two [meanings] that require explaining. [Everything] being either [like] an illusion or something not truly established,⁶ [the privative *a*] negates neither something existent nor something non-existent. By this reasoning it is ruled out [that the privative *a*] has the meaning of negating the world. I will explain the formation of the word. *Amanasikāra* means the *manasikāra* for which the letter *a* [in front of it] is the main thing. It is a compound in which the middle word is dropped, as in the case of a *śākapārthiva*, a “king [for whom] vegetables [are the main thing of his diet].” Accordingly, whatever mental engagement (*manasikāra*) there is, all of it is “*a*” which has the nature of non-origination.⁷

...

Moreover, *a* stands for the word ‘luminous’, and *manasikāra* for the word ‘self-empowerment’ (*svādhiṣṭhāna*).⁸ It is both *a* and *manasikāra*, so we get *amanasikāra*.⁹ From this, namely the word

⁶ This means that the negation must be taken as implying the mode of emptiness asserted by the Māyopamādvayavādins or that asserted by the Apratiṣṭhānavādins.

⁷ Maitrīpa analyzes *amanasikāra* as a compound in which the component *pradhāna* (“the main thing”) has been dropped. This is fully in line with Jayāditya’s and Vāmana’s *Kāśikāvṛtti* on *Aṣṭādhyāyī* 2,1,60, in which Maitrīpa’s example of “vegetable king” is analyzed as a “king for whom vegetables are the main thing.” (see KV, vol. 2, 84: *śākapradhānaḥ pārthivaḥ śākapārthivaḥ*) When it is understood thus—that one directs one’s attention (*manasikāra*) to the letter *a* as the main thing—“*a*” can no longer be the simple privative, but must stand for a more profound negation, such as the one implied by emptiness or non-origination (*anutpāda*). In other words, the first analysis, in accordance with the *Kāśikāvṛtti*, implies a second analysis of *amanasikāra*, in which *a* is taken as having the nature of *anutpāda*. This suggests that a form of mental engagement which is aware of its true nature of non-origination or emptiness is not excluded by the term “becoming mentally disengaged.” Padma dkar po’s remarks in this regard are as follows: “The letter *a* being taken to mean non-origination, [the remaining] *manasikāra* is [then] explained as mental engagement. Thus the correct mental engagement [of realizing] the meaning of the letter *a* is ‘the mental engagement of *a*’ (*a-manasikāra*). The middle word [of the compound] has been dropped, just as in the case of calling a king who is fond of vegetables a “vegetable king.” *A* stands here for the ‘perfection of insight’ (*prajñāpāramitā*), ‘not arisen’ (*an-utpanna*) and ‘not obstructed’ (*a-nirodha*).” (*Phyag chen rgyal ba’i gan mdzod* 40₁₈ – 41₆: *a yig skye ba med pa’i don du byas te | ma na si kā ra yid la byed par bshad do || de ltar na a yig gi don tshul bzhin du yid la byed pa ni | a yid la byed pa zhes sbyar te | de yang | bar gyi tshig mi mngon par byas pa lo ma la dga’ ba’i rgyal po la lo ma’i rgyal po zhes pa bzhin || ‘dir a ni shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa’o | a nu tpa nna | a ni ro dha....*). Padma dkar po’s analysis of the compound “vegetable king” is in accord with Jayakṣṇa’s *Subodhinī* commentary on the *Siddhāntakaumudī* (no. 739), where we find: *śākapriyaḥ pārthivaḥ śākapārthivaḥ* (SB, p. 178). Maitrīpa’s own analysis of the compound as “*manasikāra* for which the letter *a* is the main thing” shows, however, that he followed the *Kāśikāvṛtti*.

⁸ Tib.: “Moreover, *a* stands for the word ‘luminous’, and *manasikāra* for the word ‘self-empowerment’.”

⁹ This means that *amanasikāra* is taken here as a *karmadhāraya* compound.

amanasikāra,¹⁰ the inconceivable state of being luminous and [the one of] self-empowerment is referred to, [that is,] an awareness which continues as something that is not separate from emptiness and compassion, [i.e.,] not distinct (*advaya*) from [the level of] indivisible union.

Mahāyānaviṃśikā

I prostrate to the natural *kāya*
Which is unconditioned and without defining characteristics.
It is endowed with all supreme forms
And joined with the level “indivisible union.” (MV 1)

The seeing of the *nija[kāya]*, which is [contained]
In the *dharmā-*, *saṃbhoga*, and *nirmāṇa[kāyas]* as their true nature,
Is the appropriate [practice]
For the attainment of perfect enlightenment. (MV 2)

The seeing of this [*nijakāya*] is deep insight (*vipaśyanā*)
Because of not superimposing [anything].
This will be explained now
In accordance with the Mantrayāna. (MV 3)

Pañcatathāgatamudrāvivarāṇa

Once the thorn that it (i.e., consciousness or wisdom) exists ultimately in such a way is removed, a Mādhyamika tenet is [seen to be] superior, one established on the basis of awareness,¹¹ which is continuous in its flow of effortless non-dual “union” (*yuganaddha*) and is characterized by not abiding in anything.¹² This is realized through the kindness of a genuine guru. One may wonder, whether awareness¹³ is established here, whether, being [thus faced by] the undesired consequence [entailed by] Māyopamādvayavāda, there is no Apratiṣṭhānavāda. This is not the case [for the reason stated in *Yuktiśaṣṭikā*, verse 19:]

That which has arisen dependently
Has not arisen in terms of its own-being.
How can that which has not arisen in terms of an own-being,
Truly be called ‘arisen’? (PTMV 14 = YŚ 19)

Awareness,¹⁴ too, has arisen in dependence. Therefore [even] awareness itself is not grounded [in anything], but rather reflects the level of non-arising.

¹⁰ Skt.: “the words *amanasikāra* and so forth,” which does not make sense, since the word *amanasikāra* only is interpreted here.

¹¹ Tib.: “self-awareness.”

¹² The Tibetan translator probably read *–svasaṃvedanasiddhir mādhyamikasiddhāntaḥ śreyān* and understood: “The establishment as self-awareness ... is a supreme Mādhyamika tenet.”

¹³ Tib.: “self-awareness.”

¹⁴ Tib.: “experience.”

Maitrīpa's Madhyamaka of Non-Abiding (Apratiṣṭhāna)

Tattvadaśaka

kiṃ tattvaṃ vastuno rūpaṃ rūpaṃ cārūpakam yataḥ |
arūpaṃ¹ ca² bhaved rūpaṃ phalahetusvabhāvataḥ || (TD 4)
¹ T arāpañ² N cā-

| de nyid ci¹ na dngos rang bzhin |
| dngos po² dngos med gang yin pa'o |
| (³dngos med pa yang³) dngos por 'gyur |
| rgyu dang 'bras bu'i rang bzhin gyis | (TD 4)
¹ B cis² B dang³ P dngos po med pa'ang

evaṃ ekarasā¹ dharmā nirāsaṅgā nirāspadāḥ² |
prabhāsvarā hy³ amī sarve yathābhūtasamādhinā || (TD 5)
¹ E_{Sh}N eva rasā² T -padā³ E_SE_{Sh}N omit

| de ltar chos rnam ro gcig ste |
| thogs pa¹ med cing gnas med par |
| ji lta ba yi ting 'dzin gyis |
| 'di dag thams cad 'od gsal te | (TD 5)
¹ D omits

Amanasikārādhāra

apara āha | [E_{Sh} 61] tantre 'py asti pra¹sajyapraṭiṣedhasya² naño viṣayatvād abhāvo vācyaḥ | tan na |
prakrāntasya³ praṭiṣedhaḥ |⁴ nāprasajyaṃ praṭiśidhyata iti prasajyapraṭiṣedhaḥ | yathāsūryaṃpaśyā
rājadārāḥ | ayam arthaḥ | evaṃ nāma tā guptā rājadārā yat sūryam api na paśyantīti | atra na sūryābhā-
vaḥ kṛtaḥ⁵ | kiṃ nāma rājadārāṇāṃ yat sūryadarśanaṃ prasajyaṃ tan⁶ niṣiddham | amanasikāre 'pi na-
ñā⁷ manasikaraṇaṃ yad grāhyagrāhakādi prasaktaṃ tan niṣiddham | na manaḥ | ato na doṣaḥ |
¹ E_{Sh}N parapra-² E_{Sh}N -ṣedha³ N prakāk ? sya⁴ E_{Sh}N inserts yadi⁵ N kṛta⁶ N tān⁷ E_{Sh} naño N nañe

| gzhan yang brjod pa | rgyud na'ang¹ yod de | med par 'gag² pa ni med pa'i yul yin pa'i phyir^{2a} dngos
po med pa³ brjod par bya'o⁴ | de ni ma yin te | yod pa'i dngos po^{4a} 'gog⁵ pa ni med par dgag² pa'o ||
yang na thal ba med pa'i⁶ thal bar 'gyur ba⁷ 'gog pa'o zhes pa ni med par⁸ dgag pa'o || ji⁹ [P 152b] ltar
rgyal po'i btsun mo nyi ma ma¹⁰ mthong ba ni 'di'i don to¹¹ || 'di lta bu mi⁽¹²⁾ shes pas min zhes zer
ba'ang⁽¹²⁾ rgyal po'i chung ma de shin tu sbas pas nyi ma'ang mi mthong ba'o || 'dir 'gog⁽¹³⁾ (14) pa ni⁽¹⁴⁾
nyi ma med par ma byas pa'o || gang zhe na | rgyal po'i chung ma rnam gang [B 211a] gis nyi ma
mthong ba yod na de 'gog pa ste | yid la mi byed pa la'ang yid la byed pa gang gzung ba dang 'dzin pa
la sogs par yod pa de dag⁽¹⁵⁾ 'gog pa ste | yid⁽¹⁶⁾ ni ma yin te | 'di la skyon med do |

¹ B *nas kyang* ² B *'gog* ^{2a} D *phyir ro* ³ BD *par* ⁴ B inserts *zhe na* ^{4a} D *po'i* ⁵ BD *dgag* ⁶ P *pas* ⁷ B *bar* ⁸ BDP *pa* ⁹ B *ci* ¹⁰ B *mi* D omits ¹¹ B *te* ¹² DP *min zer zhes pa yang* ¹³ B *dgag* D *bkaḡ* ¹⁴ D *pa'i* ¹⁵ DP omit ¹⁶ D *yang*

...

yadi vātra¹ naṅo² [...] [E_S 142] vyutpattir atra kriyate | akārapradhāno⁽³⁾ manasikāro 'manasikāraḡ³⁾ | śākapārthivavat madhyapadalopī samāsaḡ | etena yāvān manasikāraḡ⁴ sarvaḡ⁵ akāraḡ⁶ | anutpādātmaka⁷ ity arthaḡ |

¹ E_{Sh} *cātra* ² N *naṅo* ³ E_SE_{Sh} 'manasikāraḡ N manasikāraḡ ⁴ N amasikāraḡ ⁵ E_SE_{Sh}N -am ⁶ E_SE_{Sh}N omit ⁷ E_S -am

'on kyang med pa'i tha snyad tsam ste | tshig 'di ni gnyis⁽¹⁾ te⁽¹⁾ brjod par bya'o || sgyu ma'am | yang dag par grub pa med pas yod pa 'gegs pa ni ma yin te | de med pa² yang ma yin no || rigs³ pa 'di yis 'gro ba⁴ dgag⁵ pa'i don ni nyams par 'gyur⁽⁶⁾ ro⁽⁶⁾ 'dir [P 153a] brjod⁽⁷⁾ par bya ste⁷⁾ | a⁸ yig gtso bor gyur pa'i yid la byed pa ni yid la mi byed pa ste | lo ma'i rgyal po bzhin tshig dbus ma phyis pa'i⁽⁹⁾ bsdu ba'o⁹⁾ || de dag¹⁰ gis ni yid la byed pa gang yin pa thams cad ni a ste | skye ba med pa'i don no¹¹ |

¹ P omits ² P *par* ³ B *rig* ⁴ B *bas* ⁵ DP 'gegs ⁶ BP omit ⁷ DP *pa tsam byas pa'o* | ⁸ BD *i* ⁹ BP *bsdus pa'o* ¹⁰ DP *gang* ¹¹ D *to*

yadi vā | a iti prabhāsvarapadam | manasikāra iti svādhiṣṭhānapadam | aś cāsau manasikāraś cety amanasikāraḡ | etenāmanasikārādīpadair acintyaprabhāsvarasvādhiṣṭhānapadaḡ śūnyatākaruṇābhinnayuganaddhāvayavāhisamvedanam āpāditaḡ bhavatīti |

| yang na a zhes bya¹ ba ni 'od gsal ba'i tshig la | yid la byed pa ni bdag la byin gyis brlab² pa'i tshig ste | 'di la'ang a yang yin la yid la byed pa'ang yin pas yid la mi byed pa'o || 'dis ni yid la mi byed pa'i gnas bsam gyis mi khyab pa'i³ 'od gsal ba bdag byin gyis brlab⁴ pa'i bdag nyid stong pa nyid dang snying rje dbyer med pa zung du 'jug pa gnyis su med pa'i rgyun yang dag par rig pa bskyed par 'gyur ro |

¹ DP omits ² P *brlabs* ³ BP *pa* ⁴ BP *brlabs*

Mahāyānaviṃśikā

nijakāyam ahaḡ vande¹ asaḡskṛtam alakṣaṇam | sarvākāravaropetaḡ yugana² ddhapadasaḡgatam || (MV 1)

¹ N *vandhe* ² N omits -na- (hypermetrical)

| zung 'jug go 'phang yang dag son |
| rnam pa kun [P 151a] gyi mchog ldan pa |
| mtshan nyid med cing 'dus ma byas |
| gnyug [B 249b] ma'i sku la⁽¹⁾ bdag phyag 'tshal¹⁾ | (MV 1)

¹ DP *phyag* [D 138a] 'tshal lo

dharmasambhoganirmāṇe¹ yan nijam² tatsvabhāvataḥ³ |
tad asya darśanam yuktam samyaksambodhisiddhaye || (MV 2)

¹ E_SE_{Sh}N -ṇā ² N *nija*- ³ E_SE_{Sh} *tat svabhāvataḥ*

| ⁽¹⁾chos dang longs spyod sprul pa la |
| gang yang gnyug ma de'i rang⁽¹⁾ |
| de la 'di mthong ⁽²⁾ldan pa yis⁽²⁾ |
| yang dag rdzogs pa'i byang chub 'grub | (MV 2)

¹ DP *bzhin* (D omits) 'di ni chos dang longs spyod sprul || *snying po de yi rang bzhin pas* ² B *bar ldan pa'i*

darśanam ca bhaved asya anāropād vipaśyanā |
mantrayānānusāreṇa tad idaṃ vakṣyate 'dhunā || (MV 3)

| 'di la mthong bar gyur ba yis |
| sgro ma btags pas lhag par mthong |
| gsang sngags theg pa'i rjes 'brangs nas |
| ⁽¹⁾da ni de 'dir⁽¹⁾ bshad par bya | (MV 3)

¹ P *de 'dir da ltar*

Pañcatathāgatamudrāvivarāṇa

[E_{Sh} 25] tad evam¹ paramārthasad iti śalyāpagame sarvatrāpratiṣṭhānarūpānābhogayugana-
ddhādvayavāhi²samvedanasiddha⁽³⁾mādhyamika⁽³⁾siddhāntaḥ śreyān⁴ | [N 16a] ayaṃ ca sadgu-
rupādaprasādād avagamyate | nanv atra samvedanasiddhau māyopamādvayavādaprasaṅ⁽⁵⁾ge
na⁽⁵⁾ sarvatrāpratiṣṭhānam iti cet | ⁽⁶⁾tan na⁽⁶⁾ |

¹ T *eva* ² E_S -*di*- ³ E_{Sh}N -*madhyamaka*- ⁴ E_{Sh}N *preyān* ⁵ E_{Sh} -*gena*- N -*ge ṇa* ⁶ E_{Sh}N omit

| de ltar na¹ don dam par² yod pa'i ⁽³⁾gzug rngu⁽³⁾ spangs te⁴ | thams cad du mi gnas pa'i rang
bzhin lhun gyis grub par ⁽⁵⁾zung du⁽⁵⁾ 'jug pa gnyis su med pa'i rgyun rang rig par grub pa ni
dbu ⁽⁶⁾ma pa'i⁽⁶⁾ grub pa'i mtha' phul [P 133a] du ⁽⁷⁾gyur pa'o⁽⁷⁾ || 'di'ang bla ma dam pa'i zhal
snga nas kyi bka' drin las rtogs par bya'o || ci ste 'dir⁸ rang rig pas grub na ni sgyu ma lta bur⁹
gnyis su med par smra bar thal bar 'gyur te | thams cad du rab tu mi gnas pa¹⁰ ni ma yin no
zhe na ⁽¹¹⁾'di ni ma yin te ⁽¹¹⁾

¹ P omits ² DP *pa* ³ B *gzugs* ⁴ DP *pa ste* ⁵ P *zug rngu* ⁶ P *ma'i* ⁷ D *phyung ba'o* ⁸ D *zhes* ⁹ P *bu*
¹⁰ D *pas* ¹¹ BP omit

yat pratīyasamutpannam notpannam¹ tat svabhāvataḥ |
svabhāvena² yan notpannam utpannam nāma tat katham || (PTMV 14)

¹ N omits ² N -*veṇa*

| ji ltar rten cing 'brel 'byung ba |
| de yi rang bzhin ma skyes pas |
| ngo bo nyid kyis¹ ma skyes gang |
| de la skye zhes ji ltar bya | (PTMV 14)

¹ P *kyi*

iti || saṃvedanaṃ ca pratīyasamutpannaṃ tasmāt saṃvedanam [E_s 52] evāpratiṣṭhitam ajāta-
padam | tathā ca |

| zhes pas ^(1so ||¹) nyams su myong ba'ang rkyen las skyes pa ste | de'i phyir | nyams su myong
ba mi gnas pas || ma skyes pa yi go 'phang ngo || de ltar yang |

¹ P omits